Peter's Denials of Jesus: Problems between the Accounts

Matthew 26:33–35, Matthew 26:57–75

Mark 14:29-31, Mark 14:53-72

Luke 22:31–34, Luke 22:54–75

John 13:36-38, John 18:12-27

Matt 26:33-35	Mark 14:29-31	Luke 22:31- 34	John 13:36-38
This very night, before a rooster crows, you will deny me 3 times	This very night, before a rooster crows TWICE, you will deny me 3 times	The rooster will not crow today until you have denied me 3 times	A rooster will not crow until you deny me 3 times
Matt 26:69-70	Mark 14:66- 68a	Luke 22:56- 57	John 18:17-18
Servant-girl: "You too were with Jesus the Galilean."	Servant-girl: "You also were with Jesus the Nazarene."	Servant-girl: "This man was with him too."	Slave-girl (doorkeeper): "You are not also one of this man's disciples, are you?"
Peter: "I do not know what you are talking about."	Peter: "I neither know nor understand what you are talking about."	Peter: "Woman, I do not know Him."	Peter: "I am not."
Matt 26:71-72	Mark 14:68b- 70a	Luke 22:58	John 18:25-27
Another servant-girl: "This man was with Jesus of Nazareth."	Rooster crows. The servant-girl began again: "This is one of them."	Another (heteros): "You are one of them too!"	They: "You are not also one of His disciples, are you?"

November	27,	2011

Peter (w/oath):	Peter denied it.	Peter:	Peter:
"I do not know		"Man, I am	"I am not."
the man."		not!"	
Matt 26:73-75	Mark 14:70b-	Luke 22:59-	John 18:25-27
	72	62	
Bystanders:	Bystanders:	Another man	Slave (relative):
"Surely you too	"Surely you are	(allos tis):	"Did I not see you
are one of them;	one of them, for	"Certainly this	in the garden with
for even the way	you are a	man also was	Him?"
you talk gives	Galilean too."	with Him, for	
you away."		he is a Galilean	
		too."	
Peter (cursing	Peter (cursing	Peter: "Man, I	Peter denied it.
and swearing): I	and swearing): I	do not know	
do not know the	do not know this	what you are	
man!"	man you are	talking about."	
	talking about!"		
Rooster crows.	Rooster crows	Rooster crows.	Rooster crows.
	second time.		

Adjusted to reflect John's inclusion of only two occurrences of denial:

Matt 26:71-72	Mark 14:68b-	Luke 22:58	John 18:25-27
	70a		
Another servant-girl:	Rooster crows. The servant-girl began again:	Another (heteros):	Second occasion of denial not reported.
"This man was with Jesus of Nazareth."	"This is one of them."	"You are one of them too!"	
Peter (w/oath): "I do not know the man."	Peter denied it.	Peter: "Man, I am not!"	

Matt 26:73-75	Mark 14:70b-	Luke 22:59-	John 18:25-27
	72	62	
Bystanders:	Bystanders:	Another man	They: "You are not
"Surely you too	"Surely you are	(allos tis):	also one of His
are one of them;	one of them, for	"Certainly this	disciples, are you?"
for even the way	you are a	man also was	
you talk gives	Galilean too."	with Him, for	
you away."		he is a Galilean	
		too."	
Peter (cursing	Peter (cursing	Peter: "Man, I	Peter:
and swearing): I	and swearing): I	do not know	"I am not."
do not know the	do not know this	what you are	
man!"	man you are	talking about."	Slave (relative):
	talking about!"		"Did I not see you
			in the garden with
			Him?"
	Rooster crows		Peter denied it.
Rooster crows.	second time.	Rooster crows.	Rooster crows.

Gospel Accounts of Peter's Denials

(English texts below are adapted from the NASV, 1995)

Jesus' Prediction of Peter's Denials

<u>Narrative element #A</u>: In response to a confident boast of courage and loyalty by Peter, Jesus prophesies to him that on the very night coming up, before the rooster's crowing has finished announcing the dawn—more specifically, before the rooster has sounded a second time—Peter will have denied Jesus on three separate occasions. Peter denies that Jesus' prediction is true and, joined by the other disciples, vows once again his courage and loyalty, even to the point of death.

Matt 26:33-35	Mark 14:29-31	Luke 22:31-34	John 13:36-38
But Peter said to	But Peter said to Him,	"Simon, Simon,	Simon Peter said to
Him, "Even though	"Even though all may	behold, Satan has	Him, "Lord, where
all may fall away	fall away, yet I will	demanded permission	are You going?" Jesus
because of You, I	not." And Jesus said to	to sift you like wheat;	answered, "Where I
will never fall away."	him, "Truly I say to	but I have prayed for	go, you cannot follow
Jesus said to him,	you, that this very	you, that your faith	Me now; but you will
"Truly I say to you	night, before a rooster	may not fail; and you,	follow later." Peter
that this <i>very</i> night,	crows twice, you	when once you have	said to Him, "Lord,
before a rooster	yourself will deny Me	turned again,	why can I not follow
crows, you will deny	three times." But	strengthen your	You right now? I will
Me three times."	Peter kept saying	brothers." But he said	lay down my life for
Peter said to Him,	insistently, "Even if I	to Him, "Lord, with	You." Jesus answered,
"Even if I have to die	have to die with You,	You I am ready to go	"Will you lay down
with You, I will not	I will not deny You!"	both to prison and to	your life for Me?
deny You." All the	And they all were	death!" And He said,	Truly, truly, I say to
disciples said the	saying the same thing	"I say to you, Peter,	you, a rooster will not
same thing too.	also.	the rooster will not	crow until you deny
		crow today until you	Me three times."
		have denied three	
		times that you know	
		Me."	

Account of Peter's Denials

<u>Narrative element #1</u>: The soldiers, having taken Jesus into custody, led him to the residence of Caiaphas, the high priest. Some (all?) of the members of the Sanhedrin had been called to meet there. They delivered Jesus first to Annas (father-in-law of Caiaphas) to be interrogated by him in private before Jesus was to be taken to be questioned before the Sanhedrin. John and Peter had followed Jesus and the soldiers from a distance until they arrived at the gate to Caiaphas' residence. John, who was known personally to the household of the high priest, was admitted

entrance into the courtyard. Peter, who was not known to the servant girl who was manning the door, was not granted entrance and remained outside the gate. John, noticing that Peter had not followed him in, returned to the gate and spoke with the doorkeeper to gain admittance for Peter. John and Peter then gathered with a crowd of onlookers (including officers of the temple guard and various servants in the high priest's household) who were sitting and warming themselves around a fire that had been built in the middle of the courtyard.

Matt 26:57-58	Mark 14:53-54	Luke 22:54-55	John 18:12-16
Those who had seized	They led Jesus away	Having arrested Him,	So the <i>Roman</i> cohort
Jesus led Him away to	to the high priest; and	they led Him away	and the commander
Caiaphas, the high	all the chief priests	and brought Him to	and the officers of the
priest, where the	and the elders and the	the house of the high	Jews, arrested Jesus
scribes and the elders	scribes gathered	priest; but Peter was	and bound Him, and
were gathered	together. Peter had	following at a	led Him to Annas
together. But Peter	followed Him at a	distance. After they	first; for he was
was following Him at	distance, right into the	had kindled a fire in	father-in-law of
a distance as far as the	courtyard of the high	the middle of the	Caiaphas, who was
courtyard of the high	priest; and he was	courtyard and had sat	high priest that year.
priest, and entered in,	sitting with the	down together, Peter	Now Caiaphas was
and sat down with the	officers and warming	was sitting among	the one who had
officers to see the	himself at the fire.	them.	advised the Jews that
outcome.			it was expedient for
			one man to die on
			behalf of the people.
			Simon Peter was
			following Jesus, and
			so was another
			disciple. Now that
			disciple was known to
			the high priest, and
			entered with Jesus
			into the court of the
			high priest, but Peter
			was standing at the
			door outside. So the
			other disciple, who
			was known to the high
			priest, went out and
			spoke to the
			doorkeeper, and
			brought Peter in.

Narrative of Jesus' interrogation and trial in the high priest's residence:

Matt 26:59-68	Mark 14:55-65	Luke	John
At this point in his account, Matthew describes some of the events related to Jesus' being interrogated by the chief priests and other members of the Sanhedrin inside the high priest's residence. These are events that are occurring concurrently to the drama that is unfolding around the fire in the courtyard outside.	At this point in his account, Mark describes some of the events related to Jesus' being interrogated by the chief priests and other members of the Sanhedrin inside the high priest's residence. These are events that are occurring concurrently to the drama that is unfolding around the fire in the courtyard outside.	No corresponding account is situated here in Luke's account. Luke includes a comparable account later.	No corresponding account is situated here in John's account. John includes a comparable account later.
Text not included. This account is outside the scope of our interest in the integrity of the accounts of Peter's denials.	Text not included. This account is outside the scope of our interest in the integrity of the accounts of Peter's denials.		

Narrative element #2: As the various onlookers were sitting and warming themselves around the fire in the courtyard, the servant girl who served as the doorkeeper comes into the courtyard and joins them all around the fire. Noticing Peter by the light of the fire, she looks intently at Peter and finally asks him, "You aren't one of this man's disciples, are you?" Peter (presumably) answers, "No." But convinced that she recognizes him, she insists, "You were with Jesus of Galilee, the Nazarene, too. Peter denied it emphatically. But she persisted, announcing to the other onlookers that Peter was one of Jesus' disciples. The more she persisted, the more emphatically Peter denied it.

Matt 26:69-70	Mark 14:66-68a	Luke 22:56-57	John 18:17-18
FIRST occasion of	FIRST occasion of	FIRST occasion of	FIRST occasion of
Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials
Now Peter was sitting	As Peter was below in	And a servant-girl,	Then the slave-girl
outside in the	the courtyard, one of	seeing him as he sat in	who kept the door
courtyard, and a	the servant-girls of the	the firelight and	said to Peter, "You
servant-girl came to	high priest came, and	looking intently at	are not also one of
him and said, "You	seeing Peter warming	him, said, "This man	this man's disciples,
too were with Jesus	himself, she looked at	was with Him too."	are you?" He said, "I
the Galilean." But he	him and said, "You	But he denied <i>it</i> ,	am not." Now the
denied <i>it</i> before them	also were with Jesus	saying, "Woman, I do	slaves and the officers
all, saying, "I do not	the Nazarene." But he	not know Him."	were standing there,
know what you are	denied it, saying, "I		having made a
talking about."	neither know nor		charcoal fire, for it
	understand what you		was cold and they
	are talking about."		were warming
			themselves; and Peter
			was also with them,
			standing and warming
			himself.

Narrative of Jesus' interrogation and trial in the high priest's residence:

Matthew	Mark	Luke	John 18:19-24
No corresponding	No corresponding	No corresponding	At this point in his
account is situated	account is situated	account is situated	account, John
here in Matthew's	here in Mark's	here in Luke's	describes some of the
account. Matthew	account. Mark	account. Luke	events related to
includes a	includes a	includes a	Jesus' being
comparable account	comparable account	comparable account	interrogated by the
earlier in his text.	earlier in his text.	later in his text.	chief priests and
			other members of the
			Sanhedrin inside the
			high priest's
			residence. These are
			events that are
			occurring
			concurrently to the
			drama that is
			unfolding around the
			fire in the courtyard
			outside.
			Text not included. It

Is The Bible Trustworthy?— Responding to Bart Ehrman Supplemental Notes: Accounts of Peter's Denials John A. "Jack" Crabtree

November 27, 2011

	is not relevant to the
	integrity of the
	parallel accounts of
	Peter's denials.

Narrative element #3: Peter's experience around the fire had proved quite uncomfortable for him. To escape further scrutiny and inquiry, he eventually left the warmth of the fire and went out to take refuge under the outer porches surrounding the courtyard. As he did so, he heard a rooster sound. Eventually, as he stood near the gateway, another servant girl saw him and announced to others who were standing nearby, "This man is one of his disciples. He was with Jesus of Nazareth." And to Peter she asserted, "You are one of his disciples." Peter denied it, swearing with an oath that he did not know Jesus.

Matt 26:71-72	Mark 14:68b-70a	Luke 22:58	John
SECOND occasion of	SECOND occasion of	SECOND occasion of	SECOND occasion of
Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials
When he had gone out	And he went out onto	A little later, another	This occasion of
to the gateway,	the porch, and a	saw him and said,	denial is not
another servant-girl	rooster crowed. The	"You are <i>one</i> of them	included in John's
saw him and said to	servant-girl saw him,	too!" But Peter said,	account—
those who were there,	and began once more	"Man, I am not!"	presumably because
"This man was with	to say to the		John is giving an
Jesus of Nazareth."	bystanders, "This is		account of only
And again he denied it	one of them!" But		those events of which
with an oath, "I do not know the man."	again he denied it.		he was an
Know the man.			eyewitness.

Narrative element #4: Peter had not succeeded at finding safety under the porches, so he returned to rejoin John at the fire in the courtyard once again. After about an hour had passed, one of the men (slave girls?) around the fire asked him once again, "You aren't one of this man's disciples, are you?" Peter emphatically denied it. But the person refused Peter's denial, "You must be. I can tell by your accent that you are a Galilean. You are one of his disciples!" The person went on to insist to the bystanders, "He is a Galilean. Most certainly he is one of his followers." The other bystanders joined in, accusing him of being a disciple of Jesus. But Peter persisted in denying their allegation. Then one of the slaves of the high priest whose relative had had his ear cut off by Peter hours before in the garden of Gethsemane said, "Didn't I see you with him in the garden?" Peter again denied that he was with Jesus. Then, just as Peter was insisting that he did not know Jesus, Jesus was led out of the room where the Sanhedrin had been questioning him and through the courtyard where Peter was standing. At that moment a rooster sounded for the second time and Jesus turned and looked at Peter. When Peter saw Jesus looking at

him, Peter remembered Jesus predicting that he would deny him three times before the rooster crowed, and he ran out and wept bitterly.

Matt 26:73-75	Mark 14:70b-72	Luke 22:59-62	John 18:25-27
THIRD occasion of	THIRD occasion of	THIRD occasion of	THIRD occasion of
Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials	Peter's denials
A little later the	And after a little while	After about an hour	Now Simon Peter was
bystanders came up	the bystanders were	had passed, another	standing and warming
and said to Peter,	again saying to Peter,	man began to insist,	himself. So they said
"Surely you too are	"Surely you are one of	saying, "Certainly this	to him, "You are not
one of them; for even	them, for you are a	man also was with	also one of His
the way you talk gives	Galilean too." But he	Him, for he is a	disciples, are you?"
you away." Then he	began to curse and	Galilean too." But	He denied <i>it</i> , and said,
began to curse and	swear, "I do not know	Peter said, "Man, I do	"I am not." One of the
swear, "I do not know	this man you are	not know what you	slaves of the high
the man!" And	talking about!"	are talking about."	priest, being a relative
immediately a rooster	Immediately a rooster	Immediately, while he	of the one whose ear
crowed. And Peter	crowed a second time.	was still speaking, a	Peter cut off, said,
remembered the word	And Peter	rooster crowed. The	"Did I not see you in
which Jesus had said,	remembered how	Lord turned and	the garden with
"Before a rooster	Jesus had made the	looked at Peter. And	Him?" Peter then
crows, you will deny	remark to him,	Peter remembered the	denied it again, and
Me three times." And	"Before a rooster	word of the Lord, how	immediately a rooster
he went out and wept	crows twice, you will	He had told him,	crowed.
bitterly.	deny Me three times."	"Before a rooster	
	And he began to	crows today, you will	
	weep.	deny Me three times."	
		And he went out and	
		wept bitterly.	

Narrative of Jesus' interrogation and trial in the high priest's residence:

Matthew	Mark	Luke 22:63-65	John
No corresponding	No corresponding	At this point in his	No corresponding
account is situated	account is situated	account, Luke	account is situated
here in Matthew's	here in Mark's	describes some of the	here in John's
account. Matthew	account. Mark	events related to	account. John
includes a	includes a	Jesus' being	includes a
comparable account	comparable account	interrogated by the	comparable account
earlier in his text.	earlier in his text.	chief priests and	earlier in his text.
		other members of the	
		Sanhedrin inside the	
		high priest's	
		residence. These are	

1.1	ccounts of Peter's Denials	3	Navambar 27, 2011
John A. "Jack" Crabtree)		November 27, 2011
		minute that have	

events that have occurred concurrently to the drama that was unfolding around the fire in the courtyard outside.
Text not included. It is not relevant to the integrity of the parallel accounts of Peter's denials.